

Discerning Elementary Particles

Muller, F.A. and Seevinck, M.P. (2009) Discerning Elementary Particles.

Full text available as:

[PDF](#) - Requires a viewer, such as [Adobe Acrobat Reader](#) or other PDF viewer.

Abstract

We extend the quantum-mechanical results of Muller & Saunders (2008) establishing the weak discernibility of an arbitrary number of similar fermions in finite-dimensional Hilbert-spaces in two ways: (a) from fermions to bosons for all finite-dimensional Hilbert-spaces; and (b) from finite-dimensional to infinite-dimensional Hilbert-spaces for all elementary particles. In both cases this is performed using operators whose physical significance is beyond doubt. This confutes the currently dominant view that (A) the quantum-mechanical description of similar particles conflicts with Leibniz's Principle of the Identity of Indiscernibles (PII); and that (B) the only way to save PII is by adopting some pre-Kantian metaphysical notion such as Scotusian haecceitas or Adamsian primitive thisness. We take sides with Muller & Saunders (2008) against this currently dominant view, which has been expounded and defended by, among others, Schrödinger, Margenau, Cortes, Dalla Chiara, Di Francia, Redhead, French, Teller, Butterfield, Mittelstaedt, Giuntini, Castellani, Krause and Huggett.

Keywords: quantum, identity, indiscernibles, elementary, particles, bosons, fermions, Leibniz, similar, particles, discernibility

[General Issues: Laws of Nature](#)

[General Issues: Reductionism/Holism](#)

Subjects: [Specific Sciences: Physics: Symmetries/Invariances](#)

[Specific Sciences: Physics](#)

[General Issues: Realism/Anti-realism](#)

[Specific Sciences: Physics: Quantum Mechanics](#)

ID Code: 4642

Deposited By: [Seevinck, Michael Patrick](#)

Deposited On: 21 May 2009

Additional Information: To appear in Philosophy of Science.