

Theories: Tools versus Models

Suárez, Mauricio and Cartwright, Nancy (2007) Theories: Tools versus Models.

Full text available as:

PDF - Requires a viewer, such as Adobe Acrobat Reader or other PDF viewer.

Abstract

In "The Toolbox of Science" (1995) together with Towfic Shomar we advocated a form of instrumentalism about scientific theories. We separately developed this view further in a number of subsequent works. Steven French, James Ladyman, Otavio Bueno and Newton Da Costa (FLBD) have since written at least eight papers and a book criticising our work. Here we defend ourselves. First we explain what we mean in denying that models derive from theory — and why their failure to do so should be lamented. Second we defend our use of the London model of superconductivity as an example. Third we point out both advantages and weaknesses of FLBD's techniques in comparison to traditional Anglophone versions of the semantic conception. Fourth we show that FLBD's version of the semantic conception has not been applied to our case study. We conclude by raising doubts about FLBD's overall project.

Keywords: Physics, models, structures, superconductivity, instrumentalism

General Issues: Models and Idealization

Subjects: General Issues: Realism/Anti-realism

General Issues: Operationalism/Instrumentalism

ID Code: 3577

Deposited By: Suárez, Mauricio
Deposited On: 07 October 2007

Additional In press, Studies in the History and Philosophy of Modern Physics. (Submitted 12 July

Information: 2004, revised 6 April 2007, accepted 25 May 2007).

Send feedback to: philsci-archive@library.pitt.edu