

Journal of Andrology, Vol. 27, No. 1, January/February 2006  
Copyright © [American Society of Andrology](#)  
DOI: 10.2164/jandrol.05068

## Comparison of Chromatin Assays for DNA Fragmentation Evaluation in Human Sperm

KAZIM R. CHOCHAN<sup>\*</sup>, JEANINE T. GRIFFIN<sup>\*</sup>, MARIE LAFROMBOISE<sup>†</sup>,  
CHRISTOPHER J. DE JONGE<sup>†</sup> AND DOUGLAS T. CARRELL<sup>\*</sup>

From <sup>\*</sup> *Andrology and IVF Laboratories, University of Utah School of Medicine, Salt Lake City, Utah; and* <sup>†</sup> *Reproductive Medicine Center, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, Minnesota.*

Correspondence to: Dr Douglas T. Carrell, Associate Professor of Surgery (Urology), OB-GYN and Physiology, Director of Andrology and IVF Laboratories, University of Utah School of Medicine, 675 Arapleen Dr, Suite 205, Salt Lake City, UT 84108 (e-mail: douglas.carrell@hsc.utah.edu).

Sperm chromatin integrity is vital for successful pregnancy and transmission of genetic material to the offspring. We evaluated chromatin integrity in sperm from 60 infertile men and 7 fertile donors comparing the sperm chromatin structure assay (SCSA), TdT-mediated-dUTP nick end labeling (TUNEL), the sperm chromatin dispersion (SCD) test, and acridine orange staining technique (AOT). The TUNEL and SCD assays showed a strong relationship with the SCSA ( $r > .866$ ;  $P < .001$ ) for sperm DNA fragmentation, both in infertile men and donors of known fertility. AOT did not show any relationship with SCSA. The breakdown of the DNA fragmentation index (DFI) into 3 categories ( $\leq 15\%$ ,  $>15\%$ - $<30\%$ , and  $\geq 30\%$ ) showed that the SCSA, TUNEL, and SCD test predict the same levels of DNA fragmentation. AOT consistently showed higher levels of DNA fragmentation for each DFI category. DNA fragmentation in sperm between infertile men and donor sperm was significantly different ( $P < .05$ ) under SCSA ( $22.0 \pm 1.6$  vs  $11.8 \pm 1.4$ ), TUNEL ( $19.5 \pm 1.3$  vs  $11.1 \pm 0.9$ ) and SCD ( $20.4 \pm 1.3$  vs  $10.8 \pm 1.1$ ), respectively. DNA fragmentation in sperm evaluated by AOT did not differ ( $P > .05$ ) between infertile men ( $31.3 \pm 2.4$ ) and donors ( $32.7 \pm 4.8$ ). AOT showed extreme variations for sperm DNA fragmentation in semen from both infertile men and donors. The problems of indistinct colors, rapid fading, and the heterogeneous staining were also faced. In conclusion, SCSA, TUNEL, and SCD show similar predictive values for DNA fragmentation, and AOT shows variable and increased levels of DNA fragmentation, which makes it of questionable value in clinical practice.

Key words: SCSA, TUNEL, SCD, AOT

### This Article

- ▶ [Full Text](#)
- ▶ [Full Text \(PDF\)](#)
- ▶ [Alert me when this article is cited](#)
- ▶ [Alert me if a correction is posted](#)

### Services

- ▶ [Similar articles in this journal](#)
- ▶ [Similar articles in PubMed](#)
- ▶ [Alert me to new issues of the journal](#)
- ▶ [Download to citation manager](#)

### Citing Articles

- ▶ [Citing Articles via HighWire](#)
- ▶ [Citing Articles via Google Scholar](#)

### Google Scholar

- ▶ [Articles by Chohan, K. R.](#)
- ▶ [Articles by Carrell, D. T.](#)
- ▶ [Search for Related Content](#)

### PubMed

- ▶ [PubMed Citation](#)
- ▶ [Articles by Chohan, K. R.](#)
- ▶ [Articles by Carrell, D. T.](#)

This article has been cited by other articles:



## HUMAN REPRODUCTION

▶ HOME

A. P. M. Sousa, R. S. Tavares, J. F. Velez de la Calle, H. Figueiredo, V. Almeida, T. Almeida-Santos, and J. Ramalho-Santos  
Dual use of Diff-Quik-like stains for the simultaneous evaluation of human sperm morphology and chromatin status  
*Hum. Reprod.*, January 1, 2009; 24(1): 28 - 36.  
[\[Abstract\]](#) [\[Full Text\]](#) [\[PDF\]](#)



## BIOLOGY of REPRODUCTION

▶ HOME

G. Cavallini, A. Crippa, M. C. Magli, N. Cavallini, A. P. Ferraretti, and L. Gianaroli  
A Study to Sustain the Hypothesis of the Multiple Genesis of Oligoasthenoteratospermia in Human Idiopathic Infertile Males  
*Biol Reprod*, October 1, 2008; 79(4): 667 - 673.  
[\[Abstract\]](#) [\[Full Text\]](#) [\[PDF\]](#)



## Reproduction

▶ HOME

F. Ardon, D. Helms, E. Sahin, H. Bollwein, E. Topfer-Petersen, and D. Waberski  
Chromatin-unstable boar spermatozoa have little chance of reaching oocytes in vivo  
*Reproduction*, April 1, 2008; 135(4): 461 - 470.  
[\[Abstract\]](#) [\[Full Text\]](#) [\[PDF\]](#)



## HUMAN REPRODUCTION

▶ HOME

L. Ramos, G.W. van der Heijden, A. Derijck, J.H. Berden, J.A.M. Kremer, J. van der Vlag, and P. de Boer  
Incomplete nuclear transformation of human spermatozoa in oligoastheno-teratospermia: characterization by indirect immunofluorescence of chromatin and thiol status  
*Hum. Reprod.*, February 1, 2008; 23(2): 259 - 270.  
[\[Abstract\]](#) [\[Full Text\]](#) [\[PDF\]](#)



## HUMAN REPRODUCTION

▶ HOME

A. A.H.A. Derijck, G. W. van der Heijden, L. Ramos, M. Giele, J. A.M. Kremer, and P. de Boer  
Motile human normozoospermic and oligozoospermic semen samples show a difference in double-strand DNA break incidence  
*Hum. Reprod.*, September 1, 2007; 22(9): 2368 - 2376.  
[\[Abstract\]](#) [\[Full Text\]](#) [\[PDF\]](#)



## Journal of ANDROLOGY

▶ HOME

G. Delbes, B. F. Hales, and B. Robaire  
Effects of the Chemotherapy Cocktail Used to Treat Testicular Cancer on Sperm Chromatin Integrity  
*J Androl*, March 1, 2007; 28(2): 241 - 249.  
[\[Abstract\]](#) [\[Full Text\]](#) [\[PDF\]](#)



## Reproduction

▶ HOME

M. Long, A. Stronati, D. Bizzaro, T. Kruger, G.-C. Manicardi, P. S. Hjelmberg, M. Spano, A. Giwercman, G. Toft, J. P. Bonde, *et al.*  
Relation between serum xenobiotic-induced receptor activities and sperm DNA damage and sperm apoptotic markers in European and Inuit populations  
*Reproduction*, February 1, 2007; 133(2): 517 - 530.

