Bilingual Interns' Barriers to Becoming Teachers: At What Cost Do We Diversify the Teaching Force?

Eileen Dugan Waldschmidt
Oregon State University

Abstract

In this article I present a critical ethnographic study of three Mexican-American bilingual interns reflecting on the ability of an alternative licensure program to address barriers that have traditionally prevented individuals from underrepresented groups in the United States from entering teaching. Most financial and work schedule barriers are addressed through a federal grant supporting the program and the availability of evening and weekend coursework. However, in this program they face new barriers including reduction in salary during the internship, a stressful workload, passing required teacher exams, inability to use their bilingual education knowledge and skills, and mentors with no experience in bilingual education and/or experience at the interns' grade level. In this article, the author offers a vision for transforming alternative licensure programs aimed at diversifying the teaching force.

Introduction

In this article I share the reflections of three interns, Norma, Gina, and Patricia (pseudonyms), in a career ladder program designed to bring bilingual instructional assistants into teaching. The interns reflect upon the barriers they have encountered and how the Title VII grant funded program addresses those barriers. The interns also describe the barriers the program has been unable to address or has actually caused.

Based upon my research with the three bilingual interns, I present in this article what became clear to me about efforts to diversify the teaching force: there is a danger that these efforts can become characterized more by neocolonialism than diversification. Spanish/English bilingual/bicultural interns are members of a subordinated group within U.S. society. Latino/a individuals have historically held the lowest paying jobs, faced racism and discrimination,

and have been educated through a subtractive form of schooling—denied the opportunity to become fully bilingual/bicultural. Efforts to diversify the teaching force may recognize the need to develop support systems for groups of bilingual interns—such as scholarships and alternative pathways to licensure—to address the ill effects of subtractive education, which include low academic achievement and limited economic resources. However, these compensatory efforts alone do not transform the inequitable economic realities of our society nor the pattern of subtractive education experienced by linguistic minorities that continues in U.S. society today. Compensatory efforts are reflective of deficit ideologies that locate the responsibility to change within the subordinated groups rather than recognizing that the need to change should be located with the dominant group. Diversification efforts based on deficit ideologies become a superficial "multicoloring" of the teaching force—adding brown faces to the multitude of white ones without addressing larger social realities of inequality. The process of diversifying through multicoloring can be very difficult on the individuals of color who have been recruited to be the "diversifiers." This is what I found to be the case with Norma, Gina, and Patricia.

I begin this article with theoretical perspectives, followed by a description of the methods and the context of the study. I then share the reflections of Norma, Gina, and Patricia in regards to the barriers to becoming teachers they have faced. I follow this with my critical analysis of their reflections, and conclude with my vision for transforming teacher education programs in order to interrupt the cycle of reproduction of assimilationist and deficit ideologies (Bartolomé, 2000) in our educational institutions and address economic inequalities in our society.

Background Information/Theoretical Perspectives

Scheurich (2000) provides examples of how deficit ideologies are a symptom of white racism:

> White people ignore racialized job patterns that are constantly before their eyes.There is a racial employment hierarchy. It is like a color chart. As you start at the bottom with those earning the least and doing the least desired work, the color is more brown and black. As you work your way up the hierarchy toward the better paid more satisfying jobs, the color slowly turns lighter, until by the time you get to the top, it is almost all white. This is not hidden. It is constantly apparent wherever you go. (p. 5)

Scheurich also states that "white racism positions people of color, the cultural norms, standards, assumptions, philosophies, etc. as last, as negative, as weak, as uncivilized, as undeveloped, as less meaningful, as less important" (p. 4). Historically, white racism in the United States, as played out in educational contexts, has resulted in unequal and discriminatory educational experiences

and opportunities. Students from underrepresented minority groups, particularly language minority students, have been underserved by our schools (Ogbu, 1978; Crawford, 1999, 2000). Current high dropout and suspension rates are indicators of our continuing failure to meet these children's needs. Numerous reports in recent years have attested to our failure to meet the needs of Latino students in our nation's cities. The National Center for Education Statistics (2001) reports that the high school completion rates for Hispanic individuals aged 25–29 years old was 62.8% in 2000 compared to 86.8% for African-Americans and 94% for white Americans. The U.S. Office of Bilingual Education and Minority Languages Affairs (1998), in *No More Excuses: The Final Report of the Hispanic Dropout Project,* states the urgency of this issue:

> The overall school completion rate has steadily increased, with some fluctuations, over the last 40 years . . . In spite of this overall improvement . . . the dropout rate for all Hispanics ages 16–24 in the United States has consistently hovered at between 30 percent and 35 percent. *There is no reason to expect that this unacceptably high rate of dropping out among Hispanic students will diminish on its own without major changes in our schools and society.* (Emphasis in the original) (p. 59)

Immigrants to our country have consistently been subjected to educational policies that devalue their culture and subtract their language through a process that has been described by Macedo (2000a) as a form of colonialism. Macedo (2000b) draws upon his own experiences as a "colonized" person in his assertions that the English only movement occurring in the United States is a form of colonialism:

> Colonialism imposes 'distinction' as an ideological yardstick against which all other cultural values are measured, including language. On the one hand, this ideological yardstick serves to overcelebrate the dominant group's language to a level of mystification (i.e., viewing English as education itself and measuring the success of bilingual programs only in terms of success in English acquisition) and, on the other hand, it devalues other languages spoken by an ever increasing number of students who now populate most urban public schools. (p. 16)

Historical patterns of racism and inequitable educational opportunities alone, however, are not to blame as Gutiérrez, Baquedano-Lopez, and Álvarez (2000) make clear:

> The focus of attention should be on the vast economic disparities and social inequalities that exacerbate and perpetuate the increasing gaps between those who can buy a more privileged education for their children, and those who must rely on public education and its inequitable distribution of resources. For example, despite the academic

> gains that minority students have made over the past few decades, a gap remains and academic achievement levels of students across schools and school districts do vary significantly. This variation, however, is rooted in the larger social problems the nation faces, and most notably the uneven allocation of resources among communities and their institutions (Berliner & Biddle, 1995). (p. 217)

Many believe that transformation of socioeconomic inequities must be addressed through education. Paolo Freire (1988) called for a reform of education through liberatory practices based on the idea of praxis: "a revolution is achieved with neither verbalism nor activism, but rather with praxis, that is, with *reflection* and *action* directed at the structures to be transformed" (emphasis in the original) (p. 120). Bartolomé (2000) calls for "critical teacher education" in which prospective bilingual teachers develop "political clarity" so that they develop "a deepening awareness of the sociopolitical and economic realities that shape their lives and their capacity to transform them" (pp. 167–168). Nieto (2000) also emphasizes the need to examine ideologies in teacher preparation programs so that future teachers "take a stand on language diversity" and "think of teaching as a lifelong journey of transformation" (p. 193). Examples in the literature of teacher education programs that reflect transformative approaches are emerging. Gebhard et al. (2002) describe the Bilingual/ESL/Multicultural Education Practitioner Program in the School of Education at the University of Massachusetts Amherst, a program with a commitment to preparing teachers to work with students "of all backgrounds, including the growing number of language minority students" and to "a pedagogical framework that critically focuses on issues of equity and social justice" (p. 220).

Currently in the United States an imbalance remains between the lack of diversity among the teachers in our schools versus the rich diversity among the children in the classrooms. Recent results from the Great City School District survey confirm a need for bilingual educators in K–12 schools (The Urban Teacher Collaborative, 2000). Yasin (2000) states that, "Despite the growing population of students whose primary language is not English, there are not enough teachers trained to work with them—and not enough programs in place to prepare more" (p. 1). Alternative certification programs designed to attract teachers from underrepresented minority groups are attempts to transform education in the United States and reverse a history of exclusion and discrimination (Boyer & Baptiste, 1996; Haberman, 1988). However, strong criticism of alternative certification programs continues. The American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education (AACTE, 1986) position statement argues, "improving the quality of instruction requires that professional education and certification standards for teachers be strengthened, not diluted" (American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education, 1986, p. 24). Wise (1994) agrees, stating, "alternative certification

approaches based on the idea that teaching is a craft to be 'picked up' in the classroom have the capacity to destroy this movement toward teacher professionalism, which has been gaining ground in the past 10 years" (p. 141).

Norma, Gina, and Patricia are in an alternative licensure program that provides them early entry into teaching prior to the completion of an undergraduate degree in response to a district's pressing need for bilingual teachers. Such early entry into teaching flies in the face of all that is recommended for teacher preparation programs from those organizations setting the national standards. AACTE's (1986) recommended components of alternative teacher preparation programs include selective admission standards with the first one being "a baccalaureate degree" (p. 24). Despite concerns regarding alternative certification models, a need to recruit quality teachers from underrepresented minority groups (Futrell, 1999) and quality bilingual teachers continues (Haberman, 1988; Mora, 2000; Menken, 2000; Torres-Guzmán, 1996). The cost for tuition, books, child care, and other expenses often prevents these individuals from entering a teacher education program, therefore making it imperative that financial support is provided (Dill, 1996). Title VII grants awarded through the U.S. Department of Education's Office of Bilingual Education and Minority Languages Affairs[1] are designed to provide this much needed financial support. While extremely important in the short run, these financial supports only address symptoms of much larger social structures that perpetuate discriminatory practices that view anything deviating from the "norm" established by the dominant group as a deficit.

Teacher preparation programs at colleges and universities and school districts across the country often have "diversification" plans to provide classroom teachers who better "reflect the diversity" of the students with whom they work. Since our last National Council for Accreditation of Teacher Education (NCATE) review had identified "diversity" as an area of weakness for our teacher education department, a diversification effort was seen as critical to maintaining our accreditation status. Our program held high hopes that offering an English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL)/bilingual endorsement program that targeted bilingual instructional assistants would result in higher numbers of students of color in our cohort. However, bilingual pre-service teachers are often products of the very linguicist system (Skutnabb-Kangas, 1999) they are being recruited to reform, one based on subtractive educational practices. Without the benefit of learning through their first language, Latina individuals are oftentimes ill-prepared to be bilingual teachers because they were denied the opportunity to develop Spanish academic language proficiency (Guerrero, 1997). Additionally, once they become bilingual pre-service teachers, they are often not provided the support needed to be successful during their teacher preparation programs (Torres-Guzmán, 1996).

My contention is that diversification efforts can be superficial and potentially harmful. They represent a crayola approach of "multicoloring" the teaching force. A much larger societal transformation needs to occur in order

for there to be truly equitable educational achievement across diverse groups of students in the United States. It is only through the critical interrogation of the normativity of whiteness, and a reformation of the gross economic disparities between groups, along with inequitable educational experiences, that teacher education diversification efforts can become projects of antiracism focused on rewriting the dominant discourse script so that it truly reflects the diversity of ideas, values, assumptions, philosophies, and cultural norms present in the multitude of differences represented by all groups living in our society. Norma, Gina, and Patricia's experiences are examples of the harm that can be caused by a teacher diversification effort, one that included efforts to address the symptoms of the deficit ideologies but did not include an effort to rewrite the dominant discourse script.

Methods: From Personal Narratives to Critical Ethnography

Quantz (1992), although hesitant to define critical ethnography, describes it as:

> One form of an empirical project associated with critical discourse, a form which a researcher utilizing field methods that place the researcher on-site attempts to represent the 'culture,' the consciousness,' or the 'lived experiences' of people living in asymmetrical power relations. As a 'project,' critical ethnography is recognized as having conscious political intentions that are oriented toward emancipatory and democratic goals. What is key to this approach is that for ethnography to be considered 'critical' it should participate in a larger 'critical' dialogue rather than follow any particular set of methods or research techniques. (p. 448–449)

I did not begin this study as a critical ethnographer. I set out to gather personal narratives in order to uncover the experiential knowledge of bilingual and bicultural intern teachers (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000; Schubert & Ayers, 1992). As I began to interview the participants and analyze the transcripts, and as I participated in the culture of their alternative licensure program over a three-year period as the program coordinator, faculty adviser, and instructor, particular themes related to discursive practices reflective of a dominant ideology that accepts unequal power relationships as the norm became too prevalent to ignore. It became increasingly apparent to me that the lived experiences of these interns were mediated by "the hegemonic field, with its bounded sociopsychological horizons, [which] garners consent to an inequitable power matrix—a set of social relations that are legitimated by their depiction as natural and inevitable" (Kincheloe & McLaren, 2000, p. 283). The "hegemonic field" in which Norma, Gina, and Patricia live states overtly that, yes, their presence is desired in the teaching force because they are bilingual and individuals of color but, no, these attributes cannot take the place of the "standards" that everyone must meet to become teachers. The fact that these "standards" favor monolingual, white, middle-class individuals goes unquestioned.

Qualitative methods are used for this critical ethnographic study to attain a greater understanding of the barriers experienced by the participants. Data sources for the study are audio-taped, open-ended interviews with the three interns, their essays written for the yearly scholarship applications, field notes from classroom visits, minutes from meetings held with the program collaborators, field notes from meetings with the state licensing board, an audio-taped focus group held with all three interns and their university supervisor, and survey results from a survey of program participants conducted by an outside evaluator. Questions for the interviews and the survey related primarily to barriers the students face as they work toward teaching licensure, but also included questions intended to elicit information about the participants' experiences in the program and suggestions for how the program can better meet their needs.

My analysis of the data focused only on the issue of barriers. I recognize this is a limitation of this study and that "there are more complex ways of addressing [my] data" (p. 825, Silverman, 2000), but I also feel that I am doing more than "a *descriptive* study based upon a clear social problem" (emphasis in the original) (p. 825). Initially, I intended to use the interns' narratives to write their teacher stories, a previous research focus of mine (Waldschmidt 1995, 1998, 1999). However, as stated above, emerging themes from their stories pointed to larger sociological issues that were implicated in what the content was in the stories of these Mexican-American women. Their stories became reflections of the interaction between their individual histories and the societal limitations that defined their lived experiences. Through a critical lens I have analyzed the transcripts of audio taped interviews, essays written by the participants, data from surveys, my field notes, and my researcher journal using note-taking of my note-taking, mind maps and graphic organizers, and writing and rewriting as part of my attempt to use this work "as a form of social or cultural criticism" (Kincheloe & McLaren, 2000, p. 290). For example, I constructed tables in which I categorized the barriers to becoming teachers that Norma, Gina, and Patricia shared in interviews. I attempted to illustrate relationships between the interns' experiences and the various individuals and institutions with whom they interacted much like a sociogram. My need to represent the data visually even lead me to draw a balance scale that was tipped to favor one side to illustrate the uneven playing field upon which the bilingual/bicultural interns entered the teacher education program with fewer resources than their white middle-class peers. I then drew the same scale only this time showing the entire scale, still tipped to favor one side, had been elevated to illustrate how the grant funds had only changed the height of the scale rather than equalizing and balancing the two sides.

Whether or not I had been involved in a study with the Norma, Gina, and Patricia, I would have still spent the last three years working closely with them and, thus, developing close relationships. This study, however, deepened those relationships and paradoxically increased the potential for harm as their experiences moved through the process of becoming translated into a

published text. I began the study with the intent of following a prescribed schedule of interviewing and gathering documents. My hoped-for linear approach became lost in my need to constantly go back and check with each of them my understanding of their words. Our discussions related to the focus of this study could not be contained within the confines of a contrived interview setting. We talked on the phone, in the classroom, in the school hallways, and in my home. Because I wanted to take care in representing their experiences, I shared drafts of this paper with Norma, Gina, and Patricia for their feedback, clarifications, and corrections.

Researcher Disclosure

I am unable to present an insider perspective of the experiences of three Mexican-American women in a teacher education program. I worked as a bilingual teacher for ten years; however, my presentation of their experiences here is unavoidably filtered through my white, middle-class, female lens. The dangers of white researchers researching individuals of color have been examined (e.g., Behar, 1993; Boyer & Baptiste, 1996; Scheurich, 2000). But my lens is also colored by a critical self-awareness, tinged by guilt and regret, that I was woefully inadequate as a bilingual teacher because I not only lacked strong Spanish academic language proficiency (Guerrero, 1997; Moll, 1999), but I also lacked requisite cultural knowledge. I had not lived as a Mexican-American individual in the United States.

I have attempted to involve the three women, Norma, Gina, and Patricia, in every phase of this research through constant member checks; however, I recognize the limitations of this research strategy. Further complicating my relationship with the interns is the fact that I am the coordinator of the program and their faculty adviser. This is a power differential that is difficult to overcome. I have made a concerted effort to be open, honest, non-judgmental, and supportive in my interactions with the interns.

The Participants

Norma, Gina, and Patricia were selected for the study for the following reasons: they are bilingual and bicultural with English and Spanish (members of the target population for the program); they were all students at the community college when they were first interviewed; they agreed to be a part of the study; and they had been referred to me by the coordinator of the community college program. As this article is being written, Norma, Gina, and Patricia have completed the associate of general studies degree and education certificate program at the community college, an internship through the university along with ESOL and bilingual coursework, and are now enrolled in summer coursework toward their Bachelor of Arts degree at the university. In the coming year they will have to continue as intern-teachers because they were unable to complete the requirements for the alternative license.

Context of the Study

It was in the late 1990s that a school district and community college in the northwestern United States designed the alternative certification program that Norma, Patricia, and Gina enter. Responding to changing demographics, the school district was eager to find ways to quickly bring bilingual and bicultural teachers into the classroom. Professors at the community college had an established education certificate program for instructional assistants, many of whom were bilingual. However, most of these individuals did not hold bachelor's degrees. Many were taking their very first college courses. Bringing these individuals into the classroom as bilingual teachers in a short turnaround time was not likely if traditional teacher education methods were employed. Therefore, a teacher preparation program was designed in which intern-teachers would be licensed prior to the completion of a bachelor's degree. When approached to become a partner in this collaboration, my teacher education department was eager to participate because of our stated commitment to social justice, our recognition of the need to diversify the teaching force, and our need to diversify our own teacher preparation cohorts.

Between July 2000 and February 2001 the state licensing board consisted of several members who challenged the approval of the alternative licensing program in which Norma, Gina, and Patricia are enrolled. One member asked at one meeting, "Does a license with less than a BA devalue the licensure system? Ought there be an alternative license in our attempt to raise the standards?" Another member, a middle-class, monolingual English-speaking woman, questioned the issue of "barriers," stating that as a single parent she overcame her barriers by applying for loans. Another member expressed concerns regarding the stress level for the program participants who continue working full time while taking coursework (field notes, November 15–16, 2000).

The argument used by instructors at the community college was that this was an "inverted model" in which the instructional assistants' experiences in the classroom working side-by-side with qualified classroom teachers provided them with pedagogical knowledge that students in traditional teacher preparation programs acquire through practicum experience. Since most of the instructional assistants were middle-aged, mature adults, it was argued that their years of experience in the classroom, their completion of an education certificate program and an associate of general studies degree from the community college, and their experiences as bicultural and bilingual individuals provided them with knowledge of language, culture, content, and pedagogy sufficient enough to prepare them to be entry-level classroom teachers. Program participants would still be required to complete a baccalaureate degree; however they would be allowed to begin teaching prior to its completion.

In my response to the state licensing board, I felt committed to supporting the early-entry-into-teaching model based on the belief that bilingual and bicultural instructional assistants possessed valuable knowledge and experience that had been excluded and gone unrecognized:

> We believe that [the licensing board's] concerns are reflective of beliefs and attitudes regarding "standards" for teachers that exclude and fail to recognize the skills and abilities of experienced bilingual instructional assistants or instructional assistants with significant experience with multilingual children in our schools. This exclusion or lack of recognition is a barrier that has kept these individuals from the teaching force. The current "standards" criteria are reflective of the skills and background of white monolingual middle class individuals. Our position is that these standards perpetuate the exclusionary practices which have led to our current crisis in which we have few role models for the diverse student population in our schools. (Author, correspondence with licensing board, November 2000)

The program was given a two-year approval under experimental status, and the battle to get final state board approval was hard fought but eventually won. Several changes to the program resulted from the many meetings with the state board. One change was that the participants must have completed 75% of their baccalaureate degree prior to entering a paid internship (instead of 50% allowed during the two-year experimental phase). A second change was that the alternative license would only be issued for one year instead of three, with a one-time, one-year renewal during which time the participants must complete the baccalaureate degree.

The Barriers

In 1996 instructional assistants throughout the district were surveyed on their interest in pursuing degrees and licensure and asked what barriers they faced. Respondents stated eight barriers, which are listed here in order of importance: tuition costs, work schedule, books, personal concerns, family issues, child care, transportation, English proficiency. It is interesting to note that Spanish proficiency was not among the barriers listed. My sense is that this is because the dominant discourse is focused on English language development and not on Spanish language development and this is reflected in the classroom practices of the school district with very few exceptions.

All eight of these concerns are either directly or indirectly related to economic (class) realities, along with social, political, and cultural forces. Concerns regarding tuition costs, books, child care, and transportation are directly related to the low income earned by instructional assistants in the school district. Work schedules for instructional assistants are the result of the political process of collective bargaining between the school district and the union. Personal concerns and family issues can result from a conflict between cultural expectations of gender roles and the workload of college students working full time, along with financial (class) struggles. English proficiency is influenced by a number of factors including family support and school experiences, along with socio-historical educational practices of

linguistic subtraction. As will be seen, Norma, Gina, and Patricia were faced with many of the barriers that surfaced in this original survey. However, they also encountered new barriers that were unanticipated.

Norma

Norma is 25 years old. Her parents came to the United States from Mexico in pursuit of a better life. Norma was born in the northwestern United States, where her father worked for a construction company, and her mother did housekeeping for a number of years. Growing up, Norma spent a short time working in the fields. When asked how she became bilingual, Norma states that her parents taught her at home to speak, read, and write her first language, Spanish, as she learned English in school.

From Instructional Assistant to Intern Teacher

When I first met Norma in the spring of 1999 she was working in a school with a high percentage of Latino/a students, many of whom were English Language Learners. During my visit we walked to the room where we would talk together, and a student and her parents approached Norma and spoke to her in Spanish. She responded respectfully in Spanish to their questions. It was obvious on the faces of the parents that they appreciated her help and they respected her as a teacher, even though at this point Norma was an instructional assistant in the school.

Norma says that the barriers keeping her from going into teaching prior to entering the program were that she (a) did not have finances, (b) could not afford books, and (c) could not afford to quit her job. She states that the program helped overcome these barriers by providing financial assistance and offering coursework in the afternoons and evenings. While taking classes at the community college Norma felt she received "great" support. Norma said she liked the way the program was set up so that they could all take the education courses together. However, once the group began to take courses for the Associate of General Studies (AGS) degree, they ended up in different classes and Norma felt that an important support system was lost.

After completing coursework for the AGS degree and the education certificate, Norma was ready to interview to become a paid intern. For her internship, Norma was placed in a school by herself. The other two new interns, Gina and Patricia, were placed together in the same school. The school district had a difficult time hiring a mentor teacher for these three new interns. A halftime mentor was found for Gina and Patricia—their mentor was a teacher in the same school. Norma, however, did not get a new mentor until the end of September. Even though Norma says that setting up the classroom at the beginning of the year was not a problem because she had observed it being done by her teachers for so many years, she still found it difficult not having a mentor to support her. Norma had a very supportive principal who believed in bilingual education, a fact that she stressed in my interviews with her.

From Intern Teacher to Licensed Teacher: Norma's Barriers

When I interviewed Norma in December 2000 she stated that, "Now we are in the classroom and it is a stressful full workload." Norma was bothered and frustrated by the two-thirds pay that they received as interns. She made the point that one-third of her pay was used to pay a mentor that was not there for her at the beginning of the year. Norma shared her frustrations with co-workers. Their responses to her were, "If you had gone through the traditional route you wouldn't be paid at all." But Norma's response was always, "I wouldn't have had full responsibility for the classroom either." Norma would go on to say then, "maybe you have the degree, but I'm doing the work. I'm required to do the same as everyone else. This is a barrier for me because it has been hard being paid less than what we made when we were instructional assistants" (Interview transcript, December 2000). Norma also mentioned personal concerns such as health issues. During the first few months of her internship, Norma missed university class sessions and was absent from work because of illness. Those who worked most closely with Norma were concerned about her stress level. Her principal shared with me that he was told by the school custodian that Norma was often in her classroom still working at 10 o'clock at night. Other personal issues that Norma mentioned were activities that she was taken away from because of hard work in her internship experience, such as involvement in her church. Norma faced other barriers. She did not have a computer at home, so she had to rely on an outdated computer in her classroom or go to a friend's house to complete coursework assignments. As this manuscript was being written, she had passed only two out of three subtests for the required teacher test.

At the conclusion of her intern year, Norma's university supervisor requested my presence at a conference with Norma and her principal in order to discuss with her the incompletes that she has taken for coursework during her internship. Norma would not be able to receive a special alternative license if she did not complete requirements for the intern year. Unfortunately, Norma's supervisor did not tell her why the conference was being held. Understandably, she was defensive and frightened as the conference began. We tried to undo the harm that was done by giving her praise for her excellent bilingual teaching skills. Her body language and the pained look on her face made me want to end the conference; however, we forged ahead and stressed the need to complete all requirements in order for her to be recommended for the special licensure that would allow her to continue teaching while completeing her bachelor's degree. Each of us, the principal, university supervisor, and myself as her faculty adviser, reiterated our belief that she was an excellent teacher. Norma, feeling overwhelmed, responded, "I have said all along that my priority is my work in the classroom. I will get the other work done, I have always planned to do that. It has been a very stressful year. I will complete the work this summer."

Gina

Gina is 37 years old and the mother of four children. When she was seven years old her family moved to the state as migrant workers. Spanish was not spoken in her home during her childhood as consistently as it had been in Norma's. Gina did not receive instruction in Spanish as Norma had received from her parents. Gina tells me that her mother had only a third grade education. Only five out of 12 of Gina's siblings graduated from high school. Gina was the only one to go on to college.

In our first interview Gina talked about why it was important to her to become a bilingual teacher:

> Unless you have struggled [like] our children are struggling now, and like we had as we were growing up, then you wouldn't know why it's really important for us that our children . . . need to learn their first language first [in school], especially if they're migrant workers . . . I have done the struggles, I know what a migrant worker does. I know how it feels to be moving one place to another. There were, you know, times that teachers . . . didn't understand me, and it was basically most of the time, so I know what our kids are struggling for, and so I really believe that bilingual education is very important, and . . . it can be accomplished. (March 26, 1999)

From Instructional Assistant to Intern Teacher

Gina worked as a bilingual instructional assistant for 12 years. At the time of the first interview, Gina was working in a bilingual dual immersion school where she initiated an interactive writing program between parents and children at the school based on the work of Erminda García, whose presentation she attended at a summer bilingual education institute (García, 1999).

For Gina, the barriers that prevented her from going into teaching were (a) tuition costs, (b) family issues, (c) cost of books, and (d) childcare. Out of these four barriers, Gina felt the program had addressed three of them with the financial support provided: tuition costs, books, and childcare. However, during my second interview with Gina, her conflicted feelings about the grant scholarship surfaced:

> I feel bad, truthfully I feel bad that I have the scholarship, because once again I've been taught to—if you want what you want, you better earn it that way, so I—there are times that I just kind of feel depressed and upset with myself because I have it . . . because this is not the way that I was raised, so it's a struggle just accepting what I have right now, because of it. (November 18, 2000)

The one barrier that Gina did not feel that the program had overcome was "family issues." In the first interview Gina stated that her participation in the program had been hard on her family but that, "we all agreed two years ago

that if I did this that we were all going to have to sacrifice." Throughout her time in the program, Gina struggled with spending so much time away from her family, working during the day and then attending coursework in the late evenings and on weekends. At one point, Gina dropped out of the program for a year because of the health of one of her younger sons. During her intern year her mother's health failed and Gina became her primary caregiver. Gina suggested having an evening event for husbands and families so that they could meet the other cohort members and the program staff, and hopefully gain a better understanding of what she and others were going through.

From Intern Teacher to Licensed Teacher: Gina's Barriers

Gina identified two new barriers to becoming a licensed teacher: The lack of a bilingual mentor and the reduction in salary during her intern year. Gina established a working relationship with the monolingual mentor that was assigned to her but she shared stories with me throughout the year, in which she felt her mentor demonstrated cultural insensitivity to her students during lessons that she modeled for Gina. As with Norma, the reduction in salary resulted in a financially stressful year for Gina.

Gina faced other barriers that did not surface in our interviews. Gina did have a computer at home, though she did not have a printer. Throughout her intern year she had trouble with her computer and, like Norma, ended up having to rely on her outdated computer in the classroom. As this article was being written, Gina had yet to pass the reading portion of the California Basic Education Skills Test (CBEST) test. She had retaken the test and failed the reading portion again. She and Norma were enrolled in an alternative course that the state education commission would accept in place of her retaking the CBEST test.

Patricia

Patricia is 43 years old. She was born in Nuevo Laredo, Mexico, and went to school in Mexico until the fourth grade. Her dad was told, "you have a large family—you should go *al norte* (to the North)." Moving to the United States at the age of 10 was a traumatic experience for Patricia. Because she knew no English she was placed in a first grade classroom. Patricia describes this as, "One of the most humiliating experiences for me." Between this period until she dropped out of high school, Patricia moved from one migrant camp to another to pick "oranges, sugar beets, tomatoes, onions, the hops, you name it." In the different schools she attended she was required to go to a special classroom because, "you were always behind. . . . They used to call us the retards." Patricia says that it went from, "bad to worse for me." She was often called names by her classmates such as "spic" and "beaner."

From Instructional Assistant to Intern Teacher

Patricia dropped out of high school, married, and completed her General Education Degree (GED). Patricia's son began an Even Start program, a program designed to "break the cycle of limited literacy by building literacy skills in both parents and children" (National Even Start Association, 2002). While participating in this program, Patricia found out about and signed up for a program offered through the school district to help parents with basic skills. Eventually she was asked if she would like to apply to become an instructional assistant with the district.

Patricia worked for nine years as a bilingual instructional assistant in preschool and kindergarten classrooms. During this time she enrolled in an early childhood education program at the local community college. It was through this program that she heard about the alternative teacher education program. She convinced a number of her friends to go into this new program with her.

When I asked Patricia what might have kept her from becoming a teacher before she found out about this program, she replied:

> I just remember thinking . . . there's no way that I could do that. There's no way that I could go and speak in front of other people. . . . There's no way that I'm going to use all those big technical words. . . . A lot of it was fear. Fear of failure. . . .The only experience I ever had was working in the fields. I had no experience working what I consider a regular job. . . . I could never see myself working with, I don't like to say this, might sound kinda . . . um . . . strange to you, *pero no sabía cómo trabajar con americanos* [I didn't know how to work with Americans], ok, I didn't know how they were going to see me. Because the experience that I had was always looking at the . . . um . . . *al patron* [the boss; owner of the farm]. . . . You gotta be careful because, you gotta be sure you're doing your job. (Interview transcript, June 2001)

Besides the personal concerns mentioned above, Patricia told me that the barriers that were preventing her from going into teaching were (a) tuition costs, (b) work schedule, and (c) cost of books. She stated that the grant covered the costs for tuition and books. The work schedule barrier was addressed by the program design with coursework being offered in the evening and on weekends.

Patricia felt, however, that the program had created new barriers for her. Upon entering the program, Patricia stated that many of the students from underrepresented minority groups were often discouraged. Patricia said, "I felt like our chances got even lower because the people who came before us [in the alternative licensure program] already had their bachelors degree. We were beginning from square one, from the basics." Patricia eventually became

so discouraged that she dropped out of the program and switched to a different university to take coursework leading to a degree in social science. When I ask Patricia about this she explained:

> I guess I got discouraged because of what happened to Mariposa [an intern in the first cohort who did not successfully complete her internship] and I said well, sheesh, she was the first *mexicana*. What's gonna happen to us? What's gonna happen to me? I'm really like dark, I'm *nopalito*—you can really tell I'm *mexicana*—you know. I kept thinking, I really want to be a *maestra* [teacher] but it seems every time I get closer something moves me back and back and back and I'm tired of going back. I want to go ahead. I'm sorry, I always keep crying . . . I got fed up. I thought, they're not taking into consideration our needs. (Interview transcript, June 2001)

Patricia applied for and received a diversity scholarship and began taking coursework toward a degree in social science at another university. But eventually Patricia decided that this was not what she wanted and that she really did want to become a teacher. She reentered the alternative certification program and applied to be an intern.

From Intern Teacher to Licensed Teacher: Patricia's Barriers

Patricia's "personal concerns" continued during her intern year with her family facing financial hardships and her husband telling her, "you always put me second," meaning, Patricia explained to me, she was no longer fulfilling his definition of her role as wife and mother. During the intern year a new barrier surfaced: "a lack of support and insensitivity from mentors and administrators." Patricia was placed in the same school as Gina for her internship year and she shared the same mentor teacher. When I visited Patricia in her classroom in the fall of 2000, I had the opportunity to see her interacting with her Spanish-speaking parents as the afternoon session began. As with Norma, it was obvious that these parents greatly appreciated someone who shared their cultural background and had the ability to communicate with them in Spanish. Patricia was surrounded by kindergartners talking to her animatedly in Spanish, some sharing happy stories while others were intent upon sharing something more serious. Later, however, Patricia shared her frustration about being told by her administrator and mentor teacher that she used too much Spanish with her kindergartners. She was frustrated that she had been placed in a school that had an English immersion model that conflicted with her beliefs about bilingual education, specifically her strong beliefs about the importance of the development of literacy in a child's first language to facilitate the learning of English.

Patricia identifies other barriers that surfaced during her intern year: (a) teacher testing, (b) intern pay, (c) mentors (lack of experience at grade level), and (d) lack of classroom supplies and resources. The intern year was a difficult one for Patricia. Her mentor teacher and university supervisor, along

with her building principal, had concerns about her classroom management and her instructional planning. Added to all of this was Patricia's desperate financial situation. Like Norma and Gina, she had taken a cut in pay to complete the internship. Patricia's husband was not working and he was having difficulty accepting the changes occurring in Patricia (i.e., becoming more independent and less submissive). Then, during one day in the winter term, when it seemed that things could not get any worse, a man arrived at Patricia's school posing as a parent who had come to pick up his child from her kindergarten classroom. The man came into Patricia's classroom and announced to her that he was there to repossess her van.

At the conclusion of her intern year, Patricia had demonstrated her ability to establish effective classroom management and do long-range planning. However, the turnaround she had been able to accomplish in her classroom teaching came too late for a recommendation for the alternative license from the school district. Her principal had to make an assessment of her teaching in February and at that time Patricia's principal stated that she would not rehire her the coming year. The district was requiring that Patricia do one more term as a paid intern in the fall, even though the university had made it clear that Patricia had met all of the requirements for completion of a successful internship.

Like Norma, Patricia did not have a computer at home and had to rely on her outdated computer and printer at her school. As with Norma and Gina, Patricia had difficulty passing the CBEST test. Unlike Norma and Gina, Patricia was not able to pass any of the subtests. As this was being written, all three interns were enrolled in the alternative course in order to meet this state licensing requirement.

Summary

Norma, Gina, and Patricia are three Latina interns, all former bilingual instructional assistants, who are on their way to becoming bilingual elementary teachers. They have had to face, and still are facing, a number of barriers in their way along this journey. All three of them stated that they would not have been able to accomplish this goal if they had not been able to find a program that would cover their tuition and book costs, and offer coursework during the afternoons, in the evening, and on Saturdays so that they could continue working and earning a living. All three was had personal concerns or family issues related to their participation in this program. Significant among these was the reduction in pay they each had to take in order to do the intern year. All three were low-income wage earners prior to the intern year, making this reduction in pay to their already low salary an extreme hardship. Finally, all three had limited access to technology and struggled to pass the required CBEST test for teacher licensure.

The intern year presented unanticipated barriers for Norma, Gina, and Patricia. Norma and Gina found themselves placed in a school with an English immersion model, where they were unable to participate in bilingual education

programs they believed in (i.e., those that provided instruction in a child's first language). The mentor-teacher assigned to them had not taken any ESOL or bilingual coursework. Norma and Patricia were assigned mentor teachers who had no prior experience working at their grade level. Lastly, Norma, Gina, and Patricia had no funds to purchase materials for their classrooms.

Discussion

Fifteen out of 17 students have successfully completed the paid internship in this alternative licensure program. All 15 are currently teaching in the school district. Five out of the 15 already had baccalaureate degrees prior to entering the program, a fact noted by Patricia in her interview. Out of the 10 remaining students, three had completed their bachelor's degrees by spring 2001.

It is important to note that the first three to finish their baccalaureate degrees were middle-class, monolingual, white females who had computers and printers at home and whose spouses earned an income sufficient enough to maintain the family lifestyle as they complete this teacher preparation program. Prior to Norma's, Gina's, and Patricia's entrance into the internship, there had been four previous Mexican-American interns. Two of these interns had been educated in Mexico. One, a male intern, had completed a bachelor's degree in Mexico and the other, a female intern, had completed a two-year teaching licensure program. These two successfully completed the internship. Of the two remaining Mexican-American interns, one was a male who needed an extension on his internship due to a family tragedy. The other intern was a female who immigrated to the United States as a child and was educated here. She did not successfully complete her internship because of a lack of content knowledge and language skills in English and Spanish.

Norma's, Gina's, and Patricia's stories in this alternative certification program are testimonies to the continued need for financial support provided to individuals from underrepresented minority groups entering teaching. Like many others (e.g., Midobuche, 1998), Title VII funds played an important role in addressing the barriers they faced in entering teaching; however, Norma, Gina, and Patricia experienced extreme financial stress during the intern year because they had to take a cut in pay. On the one hand, the school district's willingness to pay the interns while they were essentially completing a student teaching experience could be seen as being highly supportive. On the other hand, the interns did not feel that teachers and administrators in the school district had any understanding of the hardship this cut in pay caused them. Whereas the first three graduates of the program may have had to forego a family vacation because of the cut in pay during the intern year, this reduction in salary meant that Norma, Gina, and Patricia had difficulty paying their basic household bills.

On the surface, barriers unrelated to financial support should be easier to address. These include placing the interns in bilingual programs that support their beliefs in additive bilingualism and providing them with mentor-teachers

with experience in bilingual education at the interns' grade levels. However, this has been a challenge during the first three years of the program. Intern placement and mentor selection decisions are made by individuals in the school district with no background in bilingual education and little input from either the university or the district's bilingual education department. In numerous meetings, phone calls, and e-mails, those of us representing the university and the Title VII grant insist upon involvement of the bilingual education department in this alternative licensure program. I am told by the human resources department that no other school district personnel will be involved in the program other than the program coordinator, who works in the human resources department. During the 2000–2001 school year, the district hired two new directors in the bilingual education department, both of whom are Mexican-American. The work of these two individuals, along with pressure from the community, would appear to have made a difference in the district's policy. For the first time, the district is now saying that the bilingual education department will be closely involved in the program.

Moving From Exploitation to Transformation

"Diversifying the teaching force" is a common mantra in the teacher education literature. What does this mean for Norma, Gina, and Patricia? Does this make them "diversifiers"? If so, does the meaning of the word "diversifier" imply subordination in an unequal power relationship as with the word "laborer," or does it imply transformative agency as with the word "leader"? All three women at one point were "laborers." If they are now transformative agents, then their reflections are stories of years of transition from "laborer" to "transformative agent." They continued on a path to teaching from childhood to adulthood that included experiences with racism, linguicism, and financial hardship. Their parents' work was not rewarded with middle or upper class salaries. They "labored" not only in the fields but also in unwelcoming public institutions. Now, as adult women of color, bilingual speakers, former migrant workers, and individuals from an underrepresented minority group, Norma, Gina, and Patricia are welcome in, and much sought-after by educational institutions. These institutions did not help them become bilingual and biliterate. These institutions did not help them achieve academic excellence in high school so that they went on to college and then to professional careers.

Wink (2000) defines cultural capital as "the behaviors, values, and practices that are valued by the dominant society" (p. 44). Wink goes on to state that:

> These practices are determined unconsciously by the dominant culture and are used to promote success for specific groups in our society (p. 45). The dominant society uses cultural capital to lure nondominant groups into being like them. Nondominant people often are recruited for diversity, and then powerful dominant forces try to change their ways of knowing and being (p. 46).

Those of us at the university, community college, and the school district have stated in numerous venues that we have designed a program that will help diversify the teaching force through a model that is "grow your own" or "a career ladder." Both of these conceptualizations of the program represent a patriarchal relationship between program administrators and program participants. For Norma, Gina, and Patricia, this places them in the position of "being done to" (Wink, 2000). Since my involvement in the program, there has never been a meeting in which program decisions were being made and in which there was representation of the bilingual/bicultural instructional assistants for whom the program was supposedly designed.

Who benefits from Norma, Gina, and Patricia being "diversifiers"? It is assumed that children of color, particularly children who are bilingual, will benefit because they have role models. Many, but not all, believe that Norma, Gina, and Patricia's presence in teacher preparation cohorts and on teaching staffs provide their peers with a much-needed, different cultural perspective. I believe these things, but my experiences of the last three years with this alternative certification program—and Norma, and Gina, and Patricia's words and experiences—have me questioning the motives of those of us who would "diversify the teaching force." We say that we want to facilitate their entry into teaching yet we create a program that is incredibly stressful and, although it addresses many of their financial needs, it creates new financial hardships. We say we value their bilingual/bicultural knowledge and experiences, yet we place them with mentor teachers who have neither, and in schools where they can use neither.

Concluding Comments: A Vision

For too long, professed commitments to diversify the teaching force have been practiced by institutions as less representative of multiculturalism and more of mere multicoloring at the expense of individuals of color. It is indeed rare to find in educational institutions in the United States a serious self-critical transformation that has occurred, resulting in a complete re-examination of what it means to be an exemplary teacher.

Freire (1994) calls for the need to "be postmodern: radical and utopian . . . [to be] progressive" (p. 51). He tells us that, "There is no change without dream, as there is no dream without hope" (p. 91). He further states:

> As project, as design for a different, less-ugly 'world,' the dream is as necessary to political subjects, transformers of the world and not adapters to it, as . . . it is fundamental for an artisan, who projects in her or his brain what she or he is going to execute even before the execution thereof. (p. 91)

We need to dream a new vision of diversifying the teaching force that does not exact a toll on the very individuals we are hoping will become teachers. If we viewed "diversifiers" as truly transformative agents, what would that look like? I can envision a world in which bilingual and bicultural individuals are sought-after as consultants, leaders, and activists. I don't mean to exoticize these women and elevate them to superheroine status. Nor do I want to turn a blind eye toward the effects of their experiences as members of the subordinate group in our society as those who have experienced a subtractive educational system and societal racism that has left them with the need to develop their literacy skills primarily on their own and with a lack of access to resources. I want to envision a world where they are able to come to educational institutions to sit at the table as equals with ideas that are viewed as valid, important, and necessary, as individuals whose linguistic abilities are seen as assets and whose bicultural experiences are valued highly, and their working/lower class experiences and experiences with racism and linguicism are seen as important in informing our efforts toward social justice. I want them to come unapologetically with full financial, academic, cultural, and linguistic support, without fear of being seen as undeserving of such support.

Based on their experiences to this point in this alternative certification program, the three interns offer recommendations to those who may be designing similar programs to assist bilingual instructional assistants in becoming classroom teachers. These recommendations include ensuring that (a) bilingual interns are placed in schools with additive bilingual programs; (b) interns are placed with mentor-teachers who have experience in bilingual programs (preferably additive models) and at the grade levels in which the interns are placed; (c) funds are provided for interns to purchase classroom resources; and (d) social gatherings are planned to help family members make the adjustment to having a parent or spouse participate in a stressful teacher education program.

The interns' reflections reveal critical questions regarding certain effects on individuals from underrepresented minority groups who are part of "diversifying the teaching force" thanks to alternative licensure programs: How do teacher preparation programs for bilingual teachers contribute to addressing the needs of these individuals and redressing the historical pattern of harm done to them? How can a teacher preparation program become a model of transformation in which there is "a fundamental shift from coercive to collaborative relations of power" (Cummins, 1996, p. 17)? How can a teacher preparation program become one that challenges "an assimilationist belief system with a deficit ideology [one that] proves to be an especially deadly one because it rationalizes disrespecting linguistic-minority students' native language and primary culture, misteaching them dominant culture and English, and then blaming their academic difficulties on the students' 'pathological deficiencies'" (Bartolomé, 2000, p. 172). Efforts to diversify the teaching force

must not only be informed by the lived experiences of individuals from underrepresented groups, these efforts must also be truly transformed by them. In other words, the dialogical process proposed by Freire (1988), required between teacher and student in order to transform schools and society, must occur between teacher education institutions (universities, colleges, and school districts) and the bilingual pre-service teachers they are recruiting in their diversification efforts. Out of this dialogical process must come action: redefining what constitutes an exemplary teacher so that cross-cultural skills, bilingual ability, and experience with racism and lower socio-economic status are included as valuable assets for working with all children; guaranteeing bilingual pre-service teachers placement in additive bilingual programs and with support by highly qualified, experienced bilingual mentors; and, finally, committing to "a liberating pedagogy such as Freire's, [in which] educators and cultural workers throughout the world, men and women from different ethnic backgrounds, have an opportunity to engage in a global struggle for transforming existing relations of power and privilege in the service of greater social justice and human freedom" (McLaren, 2002).

References

American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education. (1986). Alternative certification: A position statement of AACTE. *Journal of Teacher Education*, *36* (3), 24.

Bartolomé, L. I. (2000). Democratizing bilingualism: The role of critical teacher education. In Z. F. Beykont (Ed.), *Lifting every voice: Pedagogy and politics of bilingualism* (pp. 167–186). Cambridge, MA: Harvard Education Publishing Group.

Behar, R. (1993). *Translated woman: Crossing the border with Esperanza's story.* Boston: Beacon.

Boyer, J. B., & Baptiste, H. P. (1996). The crisis in teacher education in America: Issues of recruitment and retention of culturally different (minority) teachers. In J. Sikula (Ed.), *Handbook of research on teacher education*, (2nd ed.). New York: MacMillan.

Clandinin, D. J., & Connelly, F. M. (2000). *Narrative inquiry: Experience and story in qualitative research.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.

Crawford, J. (1999). *Bilingual education: History, politics, theory, and practice* (4th ed.). Los Angeles: Bilingual Educational Services.

Crawford, J. (2000). *At war with diversity: U.S. language policy in an age of anxiety*. Clevedon, UK: Multilingual Matters, Ltd.

Cummins, J. (1996). *Negotiating identities: Education for empowerment in a diverse society*. Ontario, California: California Association for Bilingual Education.

Dill, V. S. (1996). Alternative teacher certification. In J. Sikula (Ed.), *Handbook of research on teacher education* (2nd ed., pp. 932–960). New York: MacMillan.

Freire, P. (1988). *Pedagogy of the oppressed.* New York: Continuum.

Freire, P. (1994). *Pedagogy of hope.* New York: Continuum.

Futrell, M. H. (1999). Recruiting minority teachers. *Educational Leadership, 56* (8), 30–33.

García, E. (1999). Keynote presentation. Presented at the Oregon Summer Bilingual Institute, Troutdale, Oregon.

Gebhard, M., Austin, T., Nieto, S., & Willett, J. (2002). 'You can't step on someone else's words': Preparing all teachers to teach language minority students. In Z. F. Beykont (Ed.), *The power of culture: Teaching across language difference* (pp. 219–243). Cambridge, MA: Harvard Education Publishing Group.

Guerrero, M. D. (1999). Spanish academic language proficiency: The case of bilingual education teachers in the U.S. *Bilingual Research Journal*, *21*, 65–84.

Gutiérrez, K., Baquedano-López, P., & Álvarez, H. (2000). The crisis in Latino education: The norming of America. In C. Tejeda, C. Martinez, & Z. L. Leonardo (Eds.), C*harting the new terrains of Chicana(o)/Latina(o) education* (pp. 213–232). New Jersey: Hampton Press.

Haberman, M. (1988). Proposals for recruiting minority teachers: Promising practices and attractive detours. *Journal of Teacher Education, 39* (4), 38–44.

Kincheloe, K. L., & McLaren, P. (2000). Rethinking critical theory and qualitative research. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research* (2nd ed., pp. 279–313). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.

Macedo, D. (2000a). Decolonizing English only: The democratic power of bilingualism. In Z. F. Beykont (Ed.), *Lifting every voice: Pedagogy and politics of bilingualism* (pp. 21–42). Cambridge, MA: Harvard Education Publishing Group.

Macedo, D. (2000b). The colonialism of the English only movement. *Educational Researcher, 29* (3), 15–24.

McLaren, C. (2002). Afterword: A legacy of hope and struggle. In A. Darder (Ed.), *Reinventing Paolo Freire: A pedagogy of love* (pp. 245–253). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Menken, K. (2000). Ensuring English language learners success: Balancing teacher quantity with quality. *National Clearinghouse for Bilingual Education*. Retrieved July 15, 2002, from http://www.ncbe.gwu.edu/ncbepubs/tasynthesis/framing/5teacherquality.htm

Midobuche, E. (1998). From LEP to academic: Reflections on my twenty years in Title VII. *Bilingual Research Journal*, *22* (1), 1–12.

Moll, L. (1999). "Captive or words: Challenging the pedagogy of control." AERA distinguished lecture. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association, Montreal, Canada.

Mora, J. K. (2000). Staying the course in times of change: Preparing teachers for language minority education. *Journal of Teacher Education*, *51* (5), 345–357.

National Center for Education Statistics. (2001). *Student effort and academic progress: Educational attainment*. Retrieved July 15, 2002, from http://nces.ed.gov/programs/coe/2001/section3/tables/t31_1.html

National Even Start Association. (2002). *Even start: Family literacy program description*. Retrieved July 15, 2002, from http://www.evenstart.org/progdesc.htm

Nieto, S. (2000). Bringing bilingual education out of the basement, and other imperatives for teacher education. In Z. F. Beykont (Ed.), *Lifting every voice: Pedagogy and politics of bilingualism* (pp. 187–207). Cambridge, MA: Harvard Education Publishing Group.

Ogbu, J. U. (1978). *Minority education and caste: The American system in cross-cultural perspective*. New York: Academic Press.

Quantz, R. A. (1992). On critical ethnography (with some postmodern considerations). In M. D. LeCompte, W. L. Millroy, & J. Preissle (Eds.), *The handbook of qualitative research in education* (pp. 447–505). New York: Academic Press.

Scheurich, J. (2000). White anti-racist scholarship: An advocacy. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association, New Orleans, LA.

Schubert, W. H., & Ayers, W. C. (Eds.). (1992). *Teacher lore: Learning from our own experience*. New York: Longman.

Silverman, D. (2000). Analyzing talk and text. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research* (2nd ed., pp. 821–834). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.

Skutnabb-Kangas, T. (1999). Linguistic human rights—Are you naïve, or what? *TESOL Journal, 8* (3), 6–12.

Torres-Guzmán, M. E. (1996). Mentoring the bilingual teacher. *NCBE Resource Collection Series, 7*, 1–11.

United States Office of Bilingual Education and Minority Languages Affairs. (1999). No more excuses: Final report of the Hispanic dropout project. (Government Document No. Ed 1.2: 2002001698). Washington, DC: U.S. Government Printing Office.

The Urban Teacher Collaborative. (2000). The urban teacher challenge: Teacher demand and supply in the greater city schools.Retrieved September 8, 2002, from http://www.cgcs.org/pdfs/utc.pdf

Waldschmidt, E. D. (1995). *Teacher stories: Bilingual teachers and creative drama*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of New Mexico.

Waldschmidt, E. D. (1998). Bilingual teachers learning about creative drama: A transformative process. *Youth Theatre Journal, 12*, 96–108.

Waldschmidt, E. D. (1999). Whose story is it? *Youth Theatre Journal, 13*, 52–59.

Wink, J. (2000). *Critical pedagogy: Notes from the real world* (2nd ed.). New York: Longman.

Wise, A. (1994). Choosing between professionalism and amateurism. *The Educational Forum*, *58*, 139–146.

Yasin, S. (2000). More attention to language diversity needed in teacher preparation. *American association of colleges for teacher education briefs*, *21* (11), 1.

Endnotes

[1] Currently Title III under the U.S. Department of Education, Office of English Language Acquisition, Language Enhancement, and Academic Achievement for LEP Students.

Acknowledgments

The author would like to thank Joan Wink for her feedback and suggestions on an earlier draft of this article.