# Non-trivial Compositions of Differential Operations and Gateaux Directional Derivative 

Branko Malešević, Ivana Jovović<br>Faculty of Electrical Engineering, University of Belgrade, Bulevar kralja Aleksandra 73, 11000 Belgrade, Serbia


#### Abstract

This paper is devoted to the enumeration of non-trivial compositions of higher order of differential operations and Gateaux directional derivative in $\mathbb{R}^{n}$. We present recurrences for counting non-trivial compositions of higher order.


Key words: compositions of differential operations, Gateaux directional derivative, differential forms, exterior derivative, Hodge star operator, enumeration of graphs and maps

## 1. Non-trivial compositions of differential operations and Gateaux directional derivative of the space $\mathbb{R}^{3}$

In the three-dimensional Euclidean space $\mathbb{R}^{3}$ we consider following sets

$$
\mathrm{A}_{0}=\left\{f: \mathbb{R}^{3} \longrightarrow \mathbb{R} \mid f \in C^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{R}^{3}\right)\right\} \quad \text { and } \quad \mathrm{A}_{1}=\left\{\vec{f}: \mathbb{R}^{3} \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}^{3} \mid \vec{f} \in \vec{C}^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{R}^{3}\right)\right\}
$$

Gradient, curl, divergence and Gateaux directional derivative in direction $\vec{e}$, for a unit vector $\vec{e}=\left(e_{1}, e_{2}, e_{3}\right) \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$, are defined in terms of partial derivative operators as follows

[^0]\[

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \operatorname{grad} f=\nabla_{1} f=\frac{\partial f}{\partial x_{1}} \vec{i}+\frac{\partial f}{\partial x_{2}} \vec{j}+\frac{\partial f}{\partial x_{3}} \vec{k}, \quad \nabla_{1}: \mathrm{A}_{0} \longrightarrow \mathrm{~A}_{1}, \\
& \operatorname{curl} \vec{f}=\nabla_{2} \vec{f}=\left(\frac{\partial f_{3}}{\partial x_{2}}-\frac{\partial f_{2}}{\partial x_{3}}\right) \vec{i}+\left(\frac{\partial f_{1}}{\partial x_{3}}-\frac{\partial f_{3}}{\partial x_{1}}\right) \vec{j}+\left(\frac{\partial f_{2}}{\partial x_{1}}-\frac{\partial f_{1}}{\partial x_{2}}\right) \vec{k}, \quad \nabla_{2}: \mathrm{A}_{1} \longrightarrow \mathrm{~A}_{1}, \\
& \operatorname{div} \vec{f}=\nabla_{3} \vec{f}=\frac{\partial f_{1}}{\partial x_{1}}+\frac{\partial f_{2}}{\partial x_{2}}+\frac{\partial f_{3}}{\partial x_{3}}, \quad \nabla_{3}: \mathrm{A}_{1} \longrightarrow \mathrm{~A}_{0}, \\
& \operatorname{dir}_{\vec{e}} f=\nabla_{0} f=\nabla_{1} f \cdot \vec{e}=\frac{\partial f}{\partial x_{1}} e_{1}+\frac{\partial f}{\partial x_{2}} e_{2}+\frac{\partial f}{\partial x_{3}} e_{3}, \nabla_{0}: \mathrm{A}_{0} \longrightarrow \mathrm{~A}_{0} .
\end{aligned}
$$
\]

Let $\mathcal{A}_{3}=\left\{\nabla_{1}, \nabla_{2}, \nabla_{3}\right\}$ and $\mathcal{B}_{3}=\left\{\nabla_{0}, \nabla_{1}, \nabla_{2}, \nabla_{3}\right\}$. The number of compositions of the $k^{\text {th }}$ order over the set $\mathcal{A}_{3}$ is $\mathrm{f}(k)=F_{k+3}$, where $F_{k}$ is the $k^{\text {th }}$ Fibonacci number (see [2] for more details). A composition of differential operations that is not 0 or $\overrightarrow{0}$ is called non-trivial. The number of non-trivial compositions of the $k^{\text {th }}$ order over the set $\mathcal{A}_{3}$ is $\mathrm{g}(k)=3$ (see for instance [1]). In paper [4], it is shown that the number of compositions of the $k^{\text {th }}$ order over the set $\mathcal{B}_{3}$ is $\mathrm{f}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)=2^{k+1}$. According to the above results, it is natural to try to calculate the number of non-trivial compositions of differential operations from the set $\mathcal{B}_{3}$. Straightforward verification shows that all compositions of the second order over $\mathcal{B}_{3}$ are

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \operatorname{dir}_{\vec{e}} \operatorname{dir}_{\vec{e}} f=\nabla_{0} \circ \nabla_{0} f=\nabla_{1}\left(\nabla_{1} f \cdot \vec{e}\right) \cdot \vec{e}, \\
& \operatorname{grad}_{\vec{e}} f=\nabla_{1} \circ \nabla_{0} f=\nabla_{1}\left(\nabla_{1} f \cdot \vec{e}\right), \\
& \Delta f=\operatorname{div} \operatorname{grad} f=\nabla_{3} \circ \nabla_{1} f, \\
& \text { curl } \operatorname{curl} \vec{f}=\nabla_{2} \circ \nabla_{2} \vec{f}, \\
& \operatorname{dir}_{\vec{e}} \operatorname{div} \vec{f}=\nabla_{0} \circ \nabla_{3} \vec{f}=\left(\nabla_{1} \circ \nabla_{3} \vec{f}\right) \cdot \vec{e}, \\
& \operatorname{grad} \operatorname{div} \vec{f}=\nabla_{1} \circ \nabla_{3} \vec{f} \\
& \operatorname{curl} \operatorname{grad} f=\nabla_{2} \circ \nabla_{1} f=\overrightarrow{0} \\
& \operatorname{div} \operatorname{curl} \vec{f}=\nabla_{3} \circ \nabla_{2} \vec{f}=0,
\end{aligned}
$$

and that only the last two are trivial. This fact leads us to use the following procedure for determining the number of non-trivial composition over the set $\mathcal{B}_{3}$. Let us define a binary relation $\sigma$ on the set $\mathcal{B}_{3}$ as follows: $\nabla_{i} \sigma \nabla_{j}$ iff the composition $\nabla_{j} \circ \nabla_{i}$ is non-trivial.

Relation $\sigma$ induces Cayley table

| $\sigma$ | $\nabla_{0}$ | $\nabla_{1}$ | $\nabla_{2}$ | $\nabla_{3}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\nabla_{0}$ | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| $\nabla_{1}$ | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| $\nabla_{2}$ | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 |
| $\nabla_{3}$ | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |

For convenience, we extend set $\mathcal{B}_{3}$ with nowhere-defined function $\nabla_{-1}$, whose domain and range are empty sets, and establish $\nabla_{-1} \sigma \nabla_{i}$ for $i=0,1,2,3$. Thus, graph $G$ of the relation $\sigma$ is rooted tree with the root $\nabla_{-1}$


Fig. 1
Here we would like to point out that the child of $\nabla_{i}$ is $\nabla_{j}$ if composition $\nabla_{j} \circ \nabla_{i}$ is non-trivial. For any non-trivial composition $\nabla_{i_{k}} \circ \ldots \circ \nabla_{i_{1}}$ there is a unique path in the tree (Fig. 1), such that the level of vertex $\nabla_{i_{j}}$ is $j$, $1 \leq j \leq k$. Let $\mathrm{g}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)$ be the number of non-trivial compositions of the $k^{\text {th }}$ order of functions from $\mathcal{B}_{3}$ and let $\mathrm{g}_{i}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)$ be the number of non-trivial compositions of the $k^{\text {th }}$ order starting with $\nabla_{i}$. Then we have

$$
\mathrm{g}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)=\mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)+\mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)+\mathrm{g}_{2}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)+\mathrm{g}_{3}^{\mathrm{G}}(k) .
$$

According to the graph $G$ we obtain the equalities

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)=\mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1), \quad \mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)=\mathrm{g}_{3}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1), \\
& \mathrm{g}_{2}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)=\mathrm{g}_{2}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1), \quad \mathrm{g}_{3}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)=\mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1) .
\end{aligned}
$$

Since the only child of $\nabla_{2}$ is $\nabla_{2}$, we can deduce

$$
\mathrm{g}_{2}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)=\mathrm{g}_{2}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)=\mathrm{g}_{2}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-2)=\ldots=\mathrm{g}_{2}^{\mathrm{G}}(1)=1
$$

Putting things together we obtain the recurrence for $\mathrm{g}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)$ :

$$
\begin{aligned}
\mathrm{g}^{\mathrm{G}}(k) & =\mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)+\mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)+\mathrm{g}_{2}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)+\mathrm{g}_{3}^{\mathrm{G}}(k) \\
& =\left(\mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)\right)+\mathrm{g}_{3}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\mathrm{g}_{2}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\left(\mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)\right) \\
& =\mathrm{g}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1) \\
& =\mathrm{g}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\left(\mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-2)+\mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-2)\right)+\mathrm{g}_{3}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-2)+\mathrm{g}_{2}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-2)-\mathrm{g}_{2}(k-2) \\
& =\mathrm{g}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\mathbf{g}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-2)-1 .
\end{aligned}
$$

Substituting $\mathrm{t}(k)=\mathrm{g}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)-1$ into previous formula we obtain recurrence $\mathrm{t}(k)=\mathrm{t}(k-1)+\mathrm{t}(k-2)$. With initial conditions $\mathrm{g}^{\mathrm{G}}(1)=4, \mathrm{~g}^{\mathrm{G}}(2)=6$, respectively $\mathrm{t}(1)=3, \mathrm{t}(2)=5$, we conclude that $\mathrm{g}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)=F_{k+3}+1$.

## 2. Non-trivial compositions of differential operations and Gateaux directional derivative of the space $\mathbb{R}^{n}$

We start this section by recalling some definitions of multivariable calculus.
Let $\mathbb{R}^{n}$ denote the $n$-dimensional Euclidean space and consider set of smooth functions $\mathrm{A}_{0}=\left\{f: \mathbb{R}^{n} \longrightarrow \mathbb{R} \mid f \in C^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{R}^{n}\right)\right\}$. The set of all differential $k$ forms on $\mathbb{R}^{n}$ is a free $\mathrm{A}_{0}$-module of rank $\binom{n}{k}$ with the standard basis $\left\{d x_{I}=\right.$ $\left.d x_{i_{1}} \ldots d x_{i_{k}} \mid 1 \leq i_{1}<\ldots<i_{k} \leq n\right\}$, denoted $\Omega^{k}\left(\mathbb{R}^{n}\right)$. Differential $k$-form $\omega$ can be written uniquely as $\omega=\sum_{I \in \mathcal{I}(k, n)} \omega_{I} d x_{I}$, where $\omega_{I} \in \mathrm{~A}_{0}$ and $\mathcal{I}(k, n)$ is the set of multi-indices $I=\left(i_{1}, \ldots, i_{k}\right), 1 \leq i_{1}<\ldots<i_{k} \leq n$. The complement of the multi-index $I$ is the multi-index $J=\left(j_{1}, \ldots, j_{n-k}\right) \in$ $\mathcal{I}(n-k, n), 1 \leq j_{1}<\ldots<j_{n-k} \leq n$, where components $j_{p}$ are elements of the set $\{1, \ldots, n\} \backslash\left\{i_{1}, \ldots, i_{k}\right\}$. We have $d x_{I} d x_{J}=\sigma(I) d x_{1} \ldots d x_{n}$, where $\sigma(I)$ is the signature of the permutation $\left(i_{1}, \ldots, i_{k}, j_{1}, \ldots, j_{n-k}\right)$.
Note that $\sigma(J)=(-1)^{k(n-k)} \sigma(I)$. With the notions mentioned above we define $\star_{k}\left(d x_{I}\right)=\sigma(I) d x_{J}$. The map $\star_{k}: \Omega^{k}\left(\mathbb{R}^{n}\right) \longrightarrow \Omega^{n-k}\left(\mathbb{R}^{n}\right)$ defined by $\star_{k}(\omega)=\sum_{I \in \mathcal{I}(k, n)} \omega_{I} \star_{k}\left(d x_{I}\right)$ is Hodge star operator and it provides natural isomorphism between $\Omega^{k}\left(\mathbb{R}^{n}\right)$ and $\Omega^{n-k}\left(\mathbb{R}^{n}\right)$. The Hodge star operator twice applied to a differential $k$-form yields $\star_{n-k}\left(\star_{k} \omega\right)=(-1)^{k(n-k)} \omega$. So for the inverse of the operator $\star_{k}$ holds $\star_{k}^{-1}(\psi)=(-1)^{k(n-k)} \star_{n-k}(\psi)$, where $\psi \in \Omega^{n-k}\left(\mathbb{R}^{n}\right)$.
A differential 0 -form is a function $f\left(x_{1}, x_{2}, \ldots, x_{n}\right) \in \mathrm{A}_{0}$. We define $d f$ to be the differential 1-form $d f=\sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{\partial f}{\partial x_{i}} d x_{i}$. Given a differential $k$-form
$\sum_{I \in \mathcal{I}(k, n)} \omega_{I} d x_{I}$, the exterior derivative $d_{k} \omega$ is differential $(k+1)$-form $d_{k} \omega=$ $\sum_{I \in \mathcal{I}(k, n)} d \omega_{I} d x_{I}$. The exterior derivative $d_{k}$ is a linear map from $k$-forms to $(k+1)$-forms which obeys Leibnitz rule: If $\omega$ is a $k$-form and $\psi$ is a $l$-form, then $d_{k+l}(\varphi \psi)=d_{k} \omega \psi+(-1)^{k} \varphi d_{l} \psi$. The exterior derivative has a property that $d_{k+1}\left(d_{k} \omega\right)=0$ for any differential $k$-form $\omega$.
Consider sets of functions

$$
\mathrm{A}_{k}=\left\{\vec{f}: \left.\mathbb{R}^{n} \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}^{\binom{n}{k}} \right\rvert\, \vec{f} \in \vec{C}^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{R}^{n}\right)\right\}
$$

$0 \leq k \leq m, m=[n / 2]$. Let $p_{k}: \Omega^{k}\left(\mathbb{R}^{n}\right) \rightarrow \mathrm{A}_{k}$ be presentation of differential forms in coordinate notation. Let us define functions $\varphi_{i}(0 \leq i \leq m)$ and $\varphi_{n-j}(0 \leq j<n-m)$ as follows

$$
\varphi_{i}=p_{i}: \Omega^{i}\left(\mathbb{R}^{n}\right) \rightarrow \mathrm{A}_{i}
$$



Then the combination of the Hodge star operator and the exterior derivative generates differential operations $\nabla_{k}=\varphi_{k} d_{k-1} \varphi_{k-1}^{-1}, \quad 1 \leq k \leq n$, in $n$-dimensional space $\mathbb{R}^{n}$ (see [3]).

$$
\begin{array}{lc}
\mathcal{A}_{n}(n=2 m): & \mathcal{A}_{n}(n=2 m+1): \\
\nabla_{1}=p_{1} d_{0} p_{0}^{-1}: A_{0} \rightarrow A_{1} & \nabla_{1}=p_{1} d_{0} p_{0}^{-1}: A_{0} \rightarrow A_{1} \\
\nabla_{2}=p_{2} d_{1} p_{1}^{-1}: A_{1} \rightarrow A_{2} & \nabla_{2}=p_{2} d_{1} p_{1}^{-1}: A_{1} \rightarrow A_{2} \\
\vdots & \vdots \\
\nabla_{i}=p_{i} d_{i-1} p_{i-1}^{-1}: A_{i-1} \rightarrow A_{i} & \nabla_{i}=p_{i} d_{i-1} p_{i-1}^{-1}: A_{i-1} \rightarrow A_{i} \\
\vdots & \vdots \\
\nabla_{m}=p_{m} d_{m-1} p_{m-1}^{-1}: A_{m-1} \rightarrow A_{m} & \nabla_{m}=p_{m} d_{m-1} p_{m-1}^{-1}: A_{m-1} \rightarrow A_{m} \\
\nabla_{m+1}=p_{m-1} \star_{m-1}^{-1} d_{m} p_{m}^{-1}: A_{m} \rightarrow A_{m-1} & \nabla_{m+1}=p_{m} \star_{m}^{-1} d_{m} p_{m}^{-1}: A_{m} \rightarrow A_{m} \\
\nabla_{m+2}=p_{m-2} \star_{m-2}^{-1} d_{m+1} \star_{m-1} p_{m-1}^{-1}: A_{m-1} \rightarrow A_{m-2} & \nabla_{m+2}=p_{m-1} \star_{m-1}^{-1} d_{m+1} \star_{m} p_{m}^{-1}: A_{m} \rightarrow A_{m-1} \\
\vdots & \nabla_{m+3}=p_{m-2} \star_{m-2}^{-1} d_{m+2} \star_{m-1} p_{m-1}^{-1}: A_{m-1} \rightarrow A_{m-2} \\
\nabla_{n-j}=p_{j} \star_{j}^{-1} d_{n-(j+1)} \star_{j+1} p_{j+1}^{-1}: A_{j+1} \rightarrow A_{j} & \vdots \\
\vdots & \nabla_{n-j}=p_{j} \star_{j}^{-1} d_{n-(j+1)} \star_{j+1} p_{j+1}^{-1}: A_{j+1} \rightarrow A_{j} \\
\nabla_{n-1}=p_{1} \star_{1}^{-1} d_{n-2} \star_{2} p_{2}^{-1}: A_{2} \rightarrow A_{1} & \vdots \\
\nabla_{n}=p_{0} \star_{0}^{-1} d_{n-1} \star_{1} p_{1}^{-1}: A_{1} \rightarrow A_{0}, & \nabla_{n-1}=p_{1} \star_{1}^{-1} d_{n-2} \star_{2} p_{2}^{-1}: A_{2} \rightarrow A_{1} \\
& \nabla_{n}=p_{0} \star_{0}^{-1} d_{n-1} \star_{1} p_{1}^{-1}: A_{1} \rightarrow A_{0} .
\end{array}
$$

List of differential operations in $\mathbb{R}^{n}$

Formulae for the number of compositions of differential operations from the set $\mathcal{A}_{n}$ and corresponding recurrences are given by Malešević in [2].
The following theorem provides a natural characterization of the number of non-trivial compositions of differential operations from the set $\mathcal{A}_{n}$. For the proof we refer reader to [2].

Theorem 2.1. All non-trivial compositions of differential operations from the set $\mathcal{A}_{n}$ are given in the following form

$$
\left(\nabla_{i} \circ\right) \nabla_{n+1-i} \circ \nabla_{i} \circ \cdots \circ \nabla_{n+1-i} \circ \nabla_{i}
$$

where $2 i, 2(i-1) \neq n, 1 \leq i \leq n$. Term in bracket is included in if the number of differential operations is odd and left out otherwise.

Theorem 2.2. Let $\mathrm{g}(k)$ be the number of non-trivial compositions of the $k^{\text {th }}$ order of differential operations from the set $\mathcal{A}_{n}$. Then we have

$$
\mathrm{g}(k)=\left\{\begin{array}{cl}
n & : 2 \nmid n, \\
n & : 2 \mid n, k=1 \\
n-1 & : 2 \mid n, k=2 \\
n-2 & : \\
2 \mid n, k>2
\end{array}\right.
$$

The Hodge dual to the exterior derivative $d_{k}: \Omega^{k}\left(\mathbb{R}^{n}\right) \longrightarrow \Omega^{k+1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{n}\right)$ is codifferential $\delta_{k-1}$, a linear map $\delta_{k-1}: \Omega^{k}\left(\mathbb{R}^{n}\right) \longrightarrow \Omega^{k-1}\left(\mathbb{R}^{n}\right)$, which is a generalization of the divergence, defined by

$$
\delta_{k-1}=(-1)^{n(k-1)+1} \star_{n-(k-1)} d_{n-k} \star_{k}=(-1)^{k} \star_{k-1}^{-1} d_{n-k} \star_{k} .
$$

Note that $\nabla_{n-j}=(-1)^{j+1} p_{j} \delta_{j} p_{j+1}^{-1}$, for $0 \leq j<n-m-1$. The codifferential can be coupled with the exterior derivative to construct the Hodge Laplacian, also known as the Laplace-de Rham operator, $\Delta_{k}: \Omega^{k}\left(\mathbb{R}^{n}\right) \longrightarrow \Omega^{k}\left(\mathbb{R}^{n}\right)$, a harmonic generalization of Laplace differential operator, given by $\Delta_{0}=\delta_{0} d_{0}$ and $\Delta_{k}=\delta_{k} d_{k}+d_{k-1} \delta_{k-1}$, for $1 \leq k \leq m$. The operator $\Delta_{0}$ is actually the negative of the Laplace-Beltrami (scalar) operator. A $k$-form $\omega$ is called harmonic if $\Delta_{k}(\omega)=0$. We say that $\vec{f} \in A_{k}$ is a harmonic function if $\omega=p_{k}{ }^{-1}(\vec{f})$ is harmonic $k$-form. If $k \geq 1$ harmonic function $\vec{f}$ is also called harmonic field. The best general reference here is [5].

Theorem 2.3. Let $\vec{f} \in A_{k}, 0 \leq k \leq m$, be a harmonic function. Then all compositions of order higher than two of differential operations from the set $\mathcal{A}_{n}, n=2 m+1$, acting on $\vec{f}$ are trivial.

Proof. The proof will be divided into three parts. Let us first examine case $k=0$. Since $f \in A_{0}$ is harmonic function we have $\Delta_{0} f=\delta_{0} d_{0} f=0$, hence $\nabla_{n} \circ \nabla_{1} f=0$ and finally $\left(\nabla_{1} \circ\right) \nabla_{n} \circ \nabla_{1} \circ \cdots \circ \nabla_{n} \circ \nabla_{1} f=0$. So we have proved that all compositions acting on harmonic function $f$ are trivial.
Our next concern will be the behavior of harmonic fields $\vec{f} \in A_{k}, 1 \leq k<m$. According to Theorem [2.1 we only need to show that compositions of the following form

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \quad\left(\nabla_{k+1} \circ\right) \nabla_{n-k} \circ \nabla_{k+1} \circ \cdots \circ \nabla_{n-k} \circ \nabla_{k+1} \vec{f} \\
& \left(\nabla_{n-(k-1)} \circ\right) \nabla_{k} \circ \nabla_{n-(k-1)} \circ \cdots \circ \nabla_{k} \circ \nabla_{n-(k-1)} \vec{f}
\end{aligned}
$$

are trivial. Since $\vec{f}$ is harmonic field, we have $\left(\delta_{k} d_{k}+d_{k-1} \delta_{k-1}\right)\left(p_{k}^{-1} \vec{f}\right)=\overrightarrow{0}$. From this we see that $\nabla_{n-k} \circ \nabla_{k+1} \vec{f}=\nabla_{k} \circ \nabla_{n-(k-1)} \vec{f}$, which implies $\nabla_{k+1} \circ$ $\left(\nabla_{n-k} \circ \nabla_{k+1}\right) \vec{f}=\nabla_{k+1} \circ\left(\nabla_{k} \circ \nabla_{n-(k-1)}\right) \vec{f}=\left(\nabla_{k+1} \circ \nabla_{k}\right) \circ \nabla_{n-(k-1)} \vec{f}$. The previous composition is trivial, because $\nabla_{k+1} \circ \nabla_{k} \vec{g}=p_{k+1} d_{k} d_{k-1} p_{k-1}^{-1} \vec{g}=0$, for any function $\vec{g} \in A_{k-1}$. In the same manner we can see that composition $\nabla_{n-(k-1)} \circ \nabla_{k} \circ \nabla_{n-(k-1)} \vec{f}$ is trivial. Therefore all compositions of order higher than two acting on harmonic field $\vec{f}$ are trivial.
It remains to prove the claim for $k=m$. Observe that $\nabla_{m+1} \circ \nabla_{m+1}=$ $p_{m} \star_{m}^{-1} d_{m} \star_{m}^{-1} d_{m} p_{m}^{-1}=p_{m} \star_{m}^{-1} d_{m} \star_{m+1} d_{m} p_{m}^{-1}=(-1)^{m+1} p_{m} \delta_{m} d_{m} p_{m}^{-1}$. The equality $\Delta_{m} \vec{f}=\delta_{m} d_{m} \vec{f}+d_{m-1} \delta_{m-1} \vec{f}=\overrightarrow{0}$ yields $\nabla_{m+1} \circ \nabla_{m+1}=\nabla_{m} \circ \nabla_{m+2}$. Similarly, we can show that all compositions of order higher than two acting on harmonic field $\vec{f} \in A_{m}$ are trivial.
The same conclusion can be drawn for compositions over the set $\mathcal{A}_{n}, n=2 m$, which act on a harmonic function $\vec{f} \in A_{k}, 0 \leq k<m-1$.
Remark. Some analogous problems can be considered also in Discrete Exterior Calculus [6] (see also [7, [8]) and Combinatorial Hodge Theory [9].
Let $f \in \mathrm{~A}_{0}$ be a scalar function and $\vec{e}=\left(e_{1}, \ldots, e_{n}\right) \in \mathbb{R}^{n}$ be a unit vector. The Gateaux directional derivative in direction $\vec{e}$ is defined by

$$
\operatorname{dir}_{\vec{e}} f=\nabla_{0} f=\sum_{k=1}^{n} \frac{\partial f}{\partial x_{k}} e_{k}: A_{0} \longrightarrow A_{0}
$$

Let us extend the set of differential operations $\mathcal{A}_{n}=\left\{\nabla_{1}, \ldots, \nabla_{n}\right\}$ with Gateaux directional derivative to the set $\mathcal{B}_{n}=\mathcal{A}_{n} \cup\left\{\nabla_{0}\right\}=\left\{\nabla_{0}, \nabla_{1}, \ldots, \nabla_{n}\right\}$. Recurrences for counting compositions of differential operations from the set $\mathcal{B}_{n}$ can be found in [4]. For an odd $n$ we can obtain a simpler recurrence $\mathrm{f}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)=2 \mathrm{f}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)$, which enable us to find easily explicit formula for the number of compositions of the $k^{\text {th }}$ order over the set $\mathcal{B}_{n} \mathrm{f}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)=2^{k-1}(n+1)$.

The number of non-trivial compositions of differential operations from the set $\mathcal{B}_{n}$ is determined by the binary relation $\nu$, defined by:
$\nabla_{i} \nu \nabla_{j}$ iff $(i=0 \wedge j=0) \vee(i=0 \wedge j=1) \vee(i=n \wedge j=0) \vee(i+j=n+1 \wedge 2 i \neq n)$.
Applying Theorem 2.2 to cases $i=2, \ldots, n-1$ we conclude that the number of non-trivial compositions of the $k^{\text {th }}$ order starting with $\nabla_{2}, \ldots, \nabla_{n-1}$ can be express by formula

$$
\mathrm{j}(k)=\mathrm{g}(k)-2=\left\{\begin{array}{lll}
n-2 & : & 2 \nmid n, \\
n-2 & : & 2 \mid n, k=1, \\
n-3 & : & 2 \mid n, \\
n-4 & : & 2 \mid n, \\
n=2
\end{array}\right.
$$

Let $\mathrm{g}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)$ be the number of non-trivial compositions of the $k^{\text {th }}$ order of operations from the set $\mathcal{B}_{n}$. Let $\mathbf{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k), \mathbf{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)$ and $\mathbf{g}_{n}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)$ be the numbers of non-trivial the $k^{\text {th }}$ order compositions starting with $\nabla_{0}, \nabla_{1}$ and $\nabla_{n}$, respectively. Then we have

$$
\mathrm{g}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)=\mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)+\mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)+\mathrm{j}(k)+\mathrm{g}_{n}^{\mathrm{G}}(k) .
$$

Denote $\widetilde{\mathbf{g}}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)=\mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)+\mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)+\mathrm{g}_{n}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)$. Hence, the following recurrences are true $\mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)=\mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1), \mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)=\mathrm{g}_{n}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1), \mathrm{g}_{n}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)=\mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)$.
Thus, the recurrence for $\widetilde{\mathrm{g}}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)$ is of the form

$$
\begin{aligned}
\widetilde{\mathrm{g}}^{\mathrm{G}}(k) & =\mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)+\mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)+\mathrm{g}_{n}^{\mathrm{G}}(k) \\
& =\left(\mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)\right)+\mathrm{g}_{n}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\left(\mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)\right) \\
& =\widetilde{\mathrm{g}}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1) \\
& =\widetilde{\mathrm{g}}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\left(\mathrm{g}_{0}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-2)+\mathrm{g}_{1}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-2)\right)+\mathrm{g}_{n}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-2) \\
& =\widetilde{\mathrm{g}}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-1)+\widetilde{\mathrm{g}}^{\mathrm{G}}(k-2) .
\end{aligned}
$$

With initial conditions $\widetilde{\mathrm{g}}^{\mathrm{G}}(1)=3, \widetilde{\mathrm{~g}}^{\mathrm{G}}(2)=5$ we deduce $\widetilde{\mathrm{g}}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)=F_{k+3}$. Therefore, we have proved following theorem.
Theorem 2.4. The number of non-trivial compositions of the $k^{\text {th }}$ order over the set $\mathcal{B}_{n}$ is

$$
\mathrm{g}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)=F_{k+3}+\mathrm{j}(k)=\left\{\begin{array}{cl}
F_{k+3}+n-2 & : 2 \nmid n, \\
n+1 & : 2 \mid n, k=1, \\
n+2 & : 2 \mid n, k=2, \\
F_{k+3}+n-4 & : 2 \mid n, k>2
\end{array}\right.
$$

The values of function $\mathrm{g}^{\mathrm{G}}(k)$ are given in [10] as the following sequences A001611 $(n=3)$, A000045 $(n=4)$, A157726 $(n=5)$, A157725 $(n=6)$, A157729 ( $n=7$ ), A157727 ( $n=8$ ).

## References

[1] B. J. Malešević, A note on higher-order differential operations, Univ. Beograd, Publ. Elektrotehn. Fak., Ser. Mat. 7 (1996) 105-109.
[2] B. J. Malešević, Some combinatorial aspects of differential operation composition on the space $\mathbb{R}^{n}$, Univ. Beograd, Publ. Elektrotehn. Fak., Ser. Mat. 9 (1998) 29-33.
[3] B. J. Malešević, Some combinatorial aspects of the composition of a set of function, Novi Sad J. Math. 36 (1) (2006) 3-9.
[4] B. J. Malešević, I. V. Jovović, The Compositions of Differential Operations and Gateaux Directional Derivative, Journal of Integer Sequences 10 (2007) 1-11.
[5] V. G. Ivančević, T. T. Ivančević, Applied differential geometry: a modern introduction, World Scientific Publishing Co. Pte. Ltd., Singapore, 2007.
[6] E. Bendito, A. Carmona, A.M. Encinas, J.M. Gesto, The curl of a weighted network, Appl. Anal. Discrete Math. 2 (2008) 241-254.
[7] W. A. Schwalm, B. Moritz, M. Giona, M. K. Schwalm, Vector difference calculus for physical lattice models, Phys. Rev. E 59 (1999) 1217-1233.
[8] P. Vabishchevich, The Vector Analysis Grid Operators for Applied Problems, Numerical Methods and Applications, Lecture Notes in Computer Science 4310 (2007) 16-27.
[9] X. Jiang, L.-H. Lim, Y. Ye, Y. Yao, Statistical Ranking and Combinatorial Hodge Theory, accepted in Mathematical Programming.
[10] N. J. A. Sloane, The On-Line Encyclopedia of Integer Sequences, published electronically at http://oeis.org, 2010.


[^0]:    E-mails: Branko Malešević [malesevic@etf.rs](mailto:malesevic@etf.rs), Ivana Jovović [ivana@etf.rs](mailto:ivana@etf.rs)
    Research is partially supported by the MNTRS, Serbia, Grant No.144020, No. 174032.

